

Committees:		Dates:
Corporate Projects Board Housing Management & Almshouses Sub-Committee Projects Sub		21 August 2018 24 September 2018 12 September 2018
Subject: Refurbishment works to lifts on the Golden Lane Estate, Southwark Estate (Collinson Court) and William Blake Estate (Lynton Mansions & St James Mansions).	Gateway 7 Outcome Report Regular	Public
Report of: Director of Community & Children's Services Report Author: David Downing		For Decision

Summary

Dashboard

Programme status	Works complete. Pending approval of Gateway 7 report and project closure.
Overall Project Risk	Green/Low
Project Status compared to Gateway 2	Budget: Green (Total budget at G2: £2,426,200,00) Specification: Green Time: Red
RAG Status against last approved	Budget: Green Specification: Green Time: Green
Approved budget at Gateway 5	Works: £1,762,964.00 Fees & Staff Costs: £193,926.04 Total: £1,956,890.04
Total Out-turn Cost at Gateway 7	Works: £1,608,462.18 Fees & Staff Costs: £106,043.09 Total: £1,714,505.27

Summary of project completed

Guideline Lift Services Ltd were contracted to comprehensively refurbish the residential lifts at Southwark Estate (Collinson Court), William Blake Estate (Lynton Mansions and St James Mansions) and all lifts on the Golden Lane Estate. The works were project managed, on behalf of the City, by Butler & Young Lift Consultants Ltd. The two-and-a-half-year programme of works was delivered on time (as per Gateway 5), to a high quality and £242,384.77 under budget.

Recommendations

1. It is recommended that the lessons learnt be noted and the project be closed.

Main Report

1. Brief description of project	Refurbishment of the lifts at Golden Lane Estate, William Blake Estate and Collinson Court (Southwark Estate). Works included the replacement of the lift car and landing doors, the installation of features to improve safety, ease of use and compliance with accessibility requirements.
2. Assessment of project against SMART Objectives	<p>No SMART objectives were set for this project at the time of inception (2014). However, in retrospect these would be as follows:</p> <p>Specific & Realistic: all lifts included in the programme to be modernised to a high standard with a 25 year life expectancy. This was achieved.</p> <p>Measurable & Achievable: the specification of the refurbished lifts meets or exceeds that prescribed by legislation (within the limitations of the structural and heritage constraints of the buildings). This was achieved.</p> <p>Timely: works programme to be structured to minimise disruption to residents as far as possible. This was achieved.</p>
3. Assessment of project against success criteria	1. All lifts covered by the project scope have been fully refurbished to provide safe use for our residents, the public and our contractors for a further 25 years.
4. Key Benefits	<p>1. Lifts have been modernised and are compliant with the stipulations of the Equalities Act 2010 (as far as the structural limitations of the buildings allow).</p> <p>2. The installation of new equipment will improve service for residents in terms of a reduction of out of service time as maintenance requirements are reduced.</p> <p>3. Increase to capital value of the blocks through improved services.</p>
5. Was the project specification fully delivered (as agreed at Gateway 5 or any subsequent Issue report)	Yes

6. Programme	The project was completed within the agreed programme																								
7. Budget	<p>The project was completed within the agreed budget</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <th colspan="2">Estimated Budget at Gateway 2</th></tr> <tr> <td>Works</td><td>£2,176,200.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Fees and staff costs</td><td>£250,000.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Total</td><td>£2,426,200.00</td></tr> </table> <table border="1"> <tr> <th colspan="2">Approved Budget at Gateway 5</th></tr> <tr> <td>Works</td><td>£1,762,964.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Fees and staff costs</td><td>£193,926.04</td></tr> <tr> <td>Total</td><td>£1,956,890.04</td></tr> </table> <table border="1"> <tr> <th colspan="2">Out-turn cost at Gateway 7</th></tr> <tr> <td>Works</td><td>£1,608,462.18</td></tr> <tr> <td>Fees and staff costs</td><td>£106,043.09</td></tr> <tr> <td>Total</td><td>£1,714,505.27</td></tr> </table> <p>The out-turn cost for works presented above includes a final retention payment of £20,183.77 due to the contractor May 2019.</p> <p>There is an overall project underspend of £242,384.77 post Gateway 5.</p> <p>Not Verified</p> <p>Verification by Chamberlains not required as project does not exceed risk or budgetary thresholds.</p>	Estimated Budget at Gateway 2		Works	£2,176,200.00	Fees and staff costs	£250,000.00	Total	£2,426,200.00	Approved Budget at Gateway 5		Works	£1,762,964.00	Fees and staff costs	£193,926.04	Total	£1,956,890.04	Out-turn cost at Gateway 7		Works	£1,608,462.18	Fees and staff costs	£106,043.09	Total	£1,714,505.27
Estimated Budget at Gateway 2																									
Works	£2,176,200.00																								
Fees and staff costs	£250,000.00																								
Total	£2,426,200.00																								
Approved Budget at Gateway 5																									
Works	£1,762,964.00																								
Fees and staff costs	£193,926.04																								
Total	£1,956,890.04																								
Out-turn cost at Gateway 7																									
Works	£1,608,462.18																								
Fees and staff costs	£106,043.09																								
Total	£1,714,505.27																								
Final Account Verification																									

***Please note that the Chamberlain's department Financial Services division will need to verify Final Accounts relating to medium and high risk projects valued between £250k and £5m and all projects valued in excess of £5m.**

Review of Team Performance

8. Key strengths	The contractor (Guideline Lift Services Ltd), the external project managers (Butler & Young Lift Consultants Ltd) and City Officers formed an effective project team to ensure that the works were finished to a high quality, to programme and were delivered within the approved budget.
9. Areas for improvement	Clearer demarcation of responsibilities within the project team for communication with residents could have been established at the outset of the delivery of the refurbishment works. Ensuring a communications plan is agreed in the pre-start meeting with contractors and the full project team would have been ideal. This issue was minor and quickly rectified but will be noted for future projects.
10. Special recognition	<p>The works contractor, Guideline Lift Services Ltd, brought forward the refurbishment programme for the lifts at Great Arthur House, Golden Lane Estate at the request of the City following a significant increase in maintenance issues with the old equipment. This accelerated programme for Great Arthur House was delivered at no additional cost.</p> <p>In addition, the expertise provided by Butler & Young Lift Consultants Ltd throughout the project (as Principal Designers and specialist project managers) proved invaluable to its successful delivery and allowed costs to be kept firmly under control as project risks were managed effectively and mitigated economically. This consultancy have worked with DCCS Property Services for a number of years and have an excellent understanding of the City's requirements, ways of working and the particular technical challenges of our housing stock. Their knowledge and expertise coupled with the works contractor's diligence, flexible approach and professionalism were a large part in the successful delivery of this project.</p>

Lessons Learnt

11. Key lessons	1. Engage with Estate Management at an earlier stage of the project to identify any mobility impaired residents who may require assistance whilst lifts are taken out of service to enact the refurbishment works.
------------------------	--

	2. Where buildings are served by only one lift, the setting of a risk budget to fund any measures required to assist or temporarily relocate mobility impaired residents should be considered.
12. Implementation plan for lessons learnt	Experience gained from this project will be implemented in other similar future projects. The lessons learnt and areas identified for improvement have already been implemented into the Middlesex Street Lift Refurbishment project currently progressing through the gateway process.

Appendices

None

Contact

Report Author	David Downing
Email Address	david.downing@cityoflondon.gov.uk
Telephone Number	0207 332 1645